

**TABLE OF CONTENTS FOR THE  
“OPEN MEETINGS LAW”**

About the Authors ..... ii

Dedication ..... ii

Not Legal Advice ..... ii

**Introduction to the Open Meetings Law..... 2**

Statutory Names are the Same ..... 2

Source of Rights ..... 2

Open Meetings ..... 2

Purpose of the Open Meetings Law ..... 2

Interpretation of the Open Meetings Law ..... 3

The Committee On Open Government ..... 3

Make up of the Committee On Open Government ..... 4

Purposes of the Committee On Open Government..... 4

Local Laws may not be More Restrictive than Open Meetings Law ..... 5

Roberts Rules of Order..... 5

**Public Bodies and Public Agencies..... 6**

What is a Public Body ..... 6

What is an “Agency” ..... 6

Names do not Dictate the Results ..... 7

Entities Comprised of Same Members as Municipal Board ..... 7

Advisory Bodies ..... 7

Advisory Committees Created by Statute ..... 9

The Education Law ..... 9

Village Zoning Board of Appeals ..... 9

Statutes Requiring Agencies to Comply with Law ..... 10

Statutes Prohibiting Compliance with the Open Meetings Law ..... 15

Task Forces ..... 15

Ad Hoc Committees ..... 16

Performing Government Functions Pursuant to a Public Charter..... 16

Performing a Public Function is Required to be Subject to Law ..... 16

Additional Examples of Public Entities/Bodies ..... 16

Business Improvement Districts.....	17
Public Bodies Created by Federal Law .....	17
Study Groups.....	18
Non-Public Agencies.....	18
Department Heads of Public Agencies.....	18
Federal Agencies are not Public Entities.....	19
College and University Associations/Groups .....	19
City Public School Leadership Teams .....	21
Parent-Teacher Associations (PTA’s).....	21
Homestead Committees.....	21
Mayor’s Task Forces.....	22
N.Y.S. Medical Advisory Committee .....	22
Policy Setting Advisory Boards .....	22
Public Commissions.....	22
Public Libraries, Cooperative Library Systems and Free Association Libraries .....	23
School District Public Libraries .....	24
Not-For-Profit Corporations.....	24
Fire Districts Must Comply with the Open Meetings Law .....	25
Fire Departments and Fire Companies.....	25
<b>Public Meetings .....</b>	<b>27</b>
Public Meetings.....	27
What is a Meeting?.....	27
“Meeting” is to be Interpreted Broadly .....	28
Taking Action is not a Requirement for a Meeting.....	29
Meetings of Two Public Bodies are Public Meetings.....	29
Public Bodies as Guests of a Non-Public Member .....	29
Telephone Calls Between Members of a Public Body.....	29
Topics Discussed are a Relevant Factor in Determining Violations.....	29
Work Sessions / Agenda Sessions.....	30
Series of Meetings with Less than a Quorum Present.....	30
Planning Sessions.....	31
Private Meetings, Work Sessions, Agenda Sessions.....	31

Pre-Meeting Discussions at a Public Meeting.....	32
Private Meetings are those with Non-Public Topics.....	32
Private Meetings may Suffice as Executive Sessions.....	33
Casual Encounters.....	33
Observational Outings/Tours/Fact Gathering.....	33
Informal Staff Meetings.....	34
Investigations.....	35
Meetings During Meals.....	35
Meals in Between Meetings.....	35
Hearings are not Meetings.....	35
Instructional Sessions are not Public Meetings.....	36
<b>Quorums.....</b>	<b>37</b>
What is a Quorum?.....	37
Attendance by Phone does not Add to a Quorum.....	37
A Quorum in the Technology Age.....	38
Majority Votes are Required to Approve Motions.....	39
<b>Circumstances which are Exempt from the Open Meetings Laws.....</b>	<b>40</b>
The “Quasi-Judicial” Gathering Exception.....	40
Examples of Quasi-Judicial Meetings/Hearings.....	41
Zoning Board Proceedings are not Always Subject to the Open Meetings Law.....	41
Planning Boards are Public Bodies.....	42
Planning and Zoning Committees.....	42
Zoning Boards of Appeal must Comply.....	43
<b>The Political Caucus Exception.....</b>	<b>44</b>
Deliberations: the Purpose of the Caucus Exception.....	44
The Exception is Limited to Protecting Discussions, not Business.....	45
Political Caucuses must be Limited to the Same Political Party.....	46
The Guests Invited to a Caucus may be From a Different Political Party.....	47
Single Party Legislatures.....	47
<b>Notice of Meetings.....</b>	<b>48</b>
Public Notice of Meetings.....	48
Proof of Notice to Media.....	49

Transmitting Notice to the Media .....	49
What is the “News Media” .....	49
In-Person Notice to a Reporter is Sufficient Notice.....	49
Actual Publication of the Notice of the Meeting is not Required .....	49
Media Coverage does not Negate Obligation to Notify the Media.....	50
Notice to Public Body Members .....	50
Notice on Websites.....	50
Reasonable Steps in Providing “Short” Notice .....	51
Unreasonable Steps in Providing “Short” Notice .....	51
Failure to Provide Adequate Notice .....	51
Agenda Need not be Part of the Notice.....	51
Starting a Meeting Early Violates the Law .....	52
Emergency Reasons are Necessary for Emergency Meetings .....	52
Notice for Video Conferencing and Streaming.....	53
Attendance Waives the Right to Sue.....	53
Public Notice Avoids Exclusion Claims .....	53
<b>Access to Records to be Discussed at a Meeting.....</b>	<b>54</b>
Maintaining a Website Requires Posting of the Records .....	54
Municipalities must have a Valid Reason why Posting is not Practicable.....	54
Posting More than Twenty-Four Hours Prior is not Required .....	55
<b>Voting.....</b>	<b>56</b>
Voting Must be in Public .....	56
Voting in Public or by Secret Ballot .....	56
<b>Accessibility of Meetings .....</b>	<b>58</b>
Barrier Free Access .....	58
Inaccessibility is Good Cause to Overturn Action at a Meeting.....	58
Requesting Public Accommodation is not Required.....	59
Security Measures are Generally Permitted .....	59
Holding of Meetings in Municipality not Required.....	60
Homes are not Proper Meeting Locations.....	60
Restaurants are not Proper Meeting Locations .....	60
Overcrowding.....	60

Relocating Crowded Meetings .....	61
Pre-Meeting, Meetings .....	62
<b>Public Participation .....</b>	<b>63</b>
Public Participation is not Mandatory .....	63
No Obligation to Answer Questions .....	63
<b>Minutes of Regular Meetings.....</b>	<b>64</b>
Generally .....	64
Minutes at Open Meetings and Hearings .....	64
Recording the Votes .....	64
Availability of Minutes to the Public .....	65
Charging for Copies of Minutes.....	66
<b>Recording Meetings .....</b>	<b>68</b>
Threats Against those who Record Meetings.....	70
Audio Recording of Public Meetings.....	70
<b>Access to and Viewing of Public Meetings.....</b>	<b>71</b>
Public Viewing.....	71
Public Access to Meetings .....	71
Recording of Meetings by Public is Required .....	71
Sample Policy on Recording Meetings .....	72
Broadcasting Required by Certain Entities .....	73
Voting by Phone is not Permitted .....	74
Participation by Officials via Video Conferencing.....	74
Authorization to Use Videoconferencing.....	75
“Local Public Bodies” must have Websites to Use Videoconferencing.....	79
Temporary Outages do not Void the Meeting.....	79
Model Videoconferencing Rules from the Committee On Open Government.....	80
<b>Executive Sessions.....</b>	<b>82</b>
Exceptions to the Rule of Open Meetings.....	82
Definition .....	82
Purpose of the Executive Sessions .....	82
Executive Sessions of Municipal Entities .....	83
Permissible Reasons for an Executive Session .....	83

Examples of Impermissible Reasons for Executive Sessions .....	84
Announcing the Reasons for Executive Sessions .....	85
The Identity of a Person that is the Subject of the Executive Session does not Need to be Disclosed .....	86
A Person that is the Subject of the Executive Session has No Right to Know More than the Public.....	86
Approving a Resolution Requires a Majority of Entire Board.....	87
Scheduling of an Executive Session.....	87
Executive Sessions may Occur any Time Throughout the Meeting .....	87
Additional Discussions may not be Held in Executive Session.....	87
The Spending of Funds is not Permitted in Executive Session.....	88
Confidentiality of Matters Discussed in Executive Session.....	88
Executive Sessions Without a Quorum.....	89
Reasons for Executive Session: Litigation must be Pending, not Possible.....	89
Attorney-Client Privilege in Executive Sessions .....	90
Reasons for Executive Session: Medical, Financial, Credit or Employment History Must Relate to an Individual .....	92
Reasons for Executive Session: Proposed Acquisition or Sale of Real Property or of Securities .....	92
Attendance at Executive Sessions .....	93
Attendance by Town Clerks and Other Secretaries .....	93
Guests Need not be Identified .....	94
Guests at Meetings of School Boards .....	94
Location of the Executive Session .....	94
Minutes in Executive Sessions.....	94
Accidental Release of Executive Session Minutes .....	95
Recordings of Executive Sessions are not Public Records .....	95
<b>Penalties for Violations of the Open Meetings Law.....</b>	<b>96</b>
Method of Commencing Challenges.....	96
Courts have Discretion to Penalize Violations.....	96
Penalties for Violations of Open Meetings Law .....	96
Remedies for Violations of Open Meetings Law Involving Executive Sessions .....	97
Overturning Bond Votes not Likely.....	97

Training as a Remedy.....	98
Removal from Public Office not Warranted for Violations.....	98
Situations when Overturning Action was Proper.....	98
<b>Burdens of Proof and Elements of Claims.....</b>	<b>99</b>
The Burden of Proof.....	99
Conclusory Allegations are not Sufficient.....	99
Mere Negligence is not a Cause For Overturning an Action.....	99
“Good Cause” must be Established.....	99
Lack of Good Cause to Overturn Action.....	100
<b>Venue of Open Meeting Challenges.....</b>	<b>102</b>
Supreme Court is Primary Venue.....	102
Federal Court is not a Valid Venue For a Challenge.....	102
Education Related Appeals may not be Taken to the Commissioner of Education.....	102
<b>“Standing” is Required to Commence an Action.....</b>	<b>103</b>
Aggrieved Parties Have Standing.....	103
Being “Aggrieved” is a Prerequisite to Void a Public Body’s Action.....	103
Who may Institute a Court Challenge to Violations.....	103
Persons Excluded from a Meeting have Standing to Challenge the Action Taken.....	104
Receiving Notice Removes Standing to Challenge Notice.....	105
<b>Time Limits to Commence Actions.....</b>	<b>106</b>
Time Limit to Commence Court Challenge.....	106
Time Limit to Challenge Conduct Constituting a Violation.....	106
Time Limit to Challenge an Action Taken During a Violation.....	107
Statute of Limitations Generally.....	107
Statute of Limitations for Violations During Executive Sessions.....	107
Statutes of Limitations can be Set by Other Statutes.....	108
Electronic Recordings of a Public Body’s Decisions.....	108
<b>Attorneys’ Fees as a Court Imposed Remedy.....</b>	<b>109</b>
Attorneys’ Fees may be Awarded.....	109
Situations Justifying the Award of Attorneys’ Fees.....	109
Situations in which Attorneys’ Fees are not Warranted.....	110
<b>Monetary Sanctions as a Remedy.....</b>	<b>112</b>

Court Imposed Sanctions .....	112
Monetary Relief is Generally not Available .....	112
<b>Defenses to Claims of Violations.....</b>	<b>113</b>
Public Notice Avoids Exclusion Claims .....	113
Subsequent Meetings can Cure Impermissible Meetings .....	113
Public Participation can Avoid Serious Penalties .....	114
Violations do not Always Void the Actions.....	114
Defense: The Meeting was “Judicial” In Nature.....	114
Defense: Violations were Unintentional .....	114
<b>Websites Maintained by Counties .....</b>	<b>115</b>
Information Required to be Posted on Website .....	115
FOIL Requires Certain Website Postings .....	116
Website Privacy Policy .....	117
Internet Service Logs .....	117
<b>Websites Maintained by Towns.....</b>	<b>118</b>
Information Required to be Posted on Website .....	118
Foil Requires Certain Website Postings.....	119
The Electronic Sign-Board.....	120
Website Privacy Policy .....	120
Internet Service Logs .....	120
<b>Websites Maintained by Villages.....</b>	<b>121</b>
Information Required to be Posted on Website .....	121
FOIL Requires Certain Website Postings .....	122
Electronic Sign-Board.....	122
Website Privacy Policy .....	123
Internet Service Logs .....	123
<b>Websites Maintained by Fire Districts.....</b>	<b>124</b>
Information Required to be Posted on Website .....	124
Foil Requires Certain Website Postings.....	125
Website Privacy Policy .....	125
Internet Service Logs .....	126



<b>Websites Maintained by School Districts .....</b>	<b>127</b>
Information Required to be Posted on Website .....	127
FOIL Requires Certain Website Postings .....	128
Website Privacy Policy .....	129
Internet Service Logs .....	129

**TABLE OF CONTENTS FOR THE  
“FREEDOM OF INFORMATION LAW”**

**Introduction to the Freedom of Information Law ..... 131**

    Purpose..... 131

    The Public Officers Law ..... 131

    Administrative Regulations Apply ..... 132

    Agencies must have Rules ..... 133

**Committee on Open Government..... 134**

    Rules and Regulations Created by the Committee are Binding..... 134

    Committee does not have the Power to Investigate or Enforce ..... 134

    Courts Should Defer to Opinions of the Committee..... 135

**What is an Agency ..... 136**

    Statement of Law ..... 136

    Judiciary Records are Usually not Subject to Disclosure ..... 136

    Traffic and Parking Violations Agency is Part of the Judiciary ..... 137

    Office of Court Administration is not Part of the Judiciary..... 137

    Entities Performing “Governmental Functions” ..... 137

    Not-For-Profit Corporations Administering Public Funds ..... 138

    Agencies Performing Advisory Roles ..... 141

    An Agency with Records Need not be a Decision-Maker ..... 141

    Additional Examples of “Agencies” ..... 141

    Federal Agencies are not within the Definition of “Agency” ..... 144

    Entities Contracting with Municipalities ..... 144

    Entities Performing Adjudicating & Prosecutorial Functions ..... 145

    What is not an Agency? ..... 145

    Not-for-Profit Ambulance Companies may be Agencies, Depending on Various Factors .... 146

**What are “Records” ..... 148**

    A “Record” is to be Defined Broadly ..... 148

    Documents Created by Public Entities are Records ..... 149

    Documents “Kept” and “Held” by an Agency are Records..... 149

Information Held for a Public Agency is a Record.....	149
Information Created by Private Entities to Comply with Public Regulations .....	149
Examples of “Records” .....	150
Photographs are Records.....	151
Electronically Stored Information and Metadata are Records .....	151
Software as a Record .....	152
Subpoenas are not Records .....	152
Physical Evidence is not a Record .....	153
Titles and Classifications of Records are not Determinative.....	153
Confidentiality Markings are not Relevant.....	154
Private Records are Still Records .....	154
<b>The Records Access Officer .....</b>	<b>155</b>
Designation .....	155
Duties .....	155
<b>Public Inspection of Records .....</b>	<b>156</b>
Contracts Void which Limit Rights of the Public.....	156
<b>Duty to Maintain Lists of Certain Records .....</b>	<b>157</b>
Statement of Law .....	157
Subject Matter List.....	157
Duty to Update List.....	157
State Agencies Must Post on Website .....	157
Trade Secrets.....	158
<b>Duty to Maintain Final Votes of Members .....</b>	<b>159</b>
Statement of Law .....	159
Voting by Secret Ballot is not Authorized.....	159
The Open Meetings Law is Less Strict than FOIL .....	159
Format for Recording Final Votes .....	159
<b>Duty to Maintain Certain Information for Officers and Employees .....</b>	<b>161</b>
Statement of Law .....	161
Creating the Record Once Requested is not Sufficient.....	161
The “Invasion of Privacy” Exception .....	161

Public Office Comes with Limited Rights of Privacy .....	161
Home Addresses are Exempt .....	162
Name and Home Addresses are Exempt for Retirees and Applicants.....	163
<b>Duty to Design Electronic Retrieval Methods to Maximize Public Access.....</b>	<b>164</b>
<b>Duty to Post Information on Website.....</b>	<b>165</b>
Required Website Postings Pursuant to FOIL .....	165
Other Required Website Postings .....	166
Website Privacy Policy .....	166
Internet Service Logs .....	167
<b>Duty of State Agencies to Post Information on Website .....</b>	<b>168</b>
Statement of Law .....	168
<b>Who may Submit a FOIL Request .....</b>	<b>169</b>
Statement of Law .....	169
A Government’s Authorization to make FOIL Requests .....	169
Pending Litigation does not Prevent FOIL Requests.....	170
Civil Discovery Rules are more Restrictive than FOIL.....	170
<b>How to Submit a FOIL Request .....</b>	<b>171</b>
Records must be “Reasonably Described” .....	171
Records Requested do not have to be Similar or Related.....	171
Sample Form for FOIL Requests.....	171
<b>Responses to a FOIL Request .....</b>	<b>173</b>
Format of Responses.....	173
Requests may not be Separated by the Agency .....	173
Time Limitations.....	173
Agency’s Failure to Meet Deadlines can Constitute a Denial .....	174
There are Limited Permissible Reasons for Delay .....	174
Fees may be Charged in Some Cases .....	175
Three Statutorily Permitted Responses to a FOIL Request Exist.....	176
Sample Response Approving Request .....	176
Sample Response Acknowledging Request with Determination within 20 Days .....	177

Sample Response Acknowledging Request with Explanation for Determination Longer than 20 Days .....	177
Sample Response Denying a Request in Whole .....	178
Sample Response Denying a Request in Part .....	179
Sample Response Records not Reasonably Described .....	180
Sample Response Records not Found or not in Agency’s Possession.....	180
Sample Response Request Requires Solicitation and Fundraising Certification.....	181
Sample Solicitation and Fundraising Certification .....	181
Sample Response Request of Person’s Own Private Records .....	182
Sample Personal Records Certification .....	182
<b>Inability to Locate Records .....</b>	<b>183</b>
Requirements Generally.....	183
Certification Required.....	183
No Specific Certification Form is Required .....	184
Who may Provide Certification .....	184
Records no Longer in Agency Possession .....	184
Sample Certification .....	185
<b>Methods of Disclosing Records .....</b>	<b>186</b>
Statement of Law .....	186
Actual Copies are not Required .....	186
Releasing Records via Internet, Computer Links and Data Drives .....	186
Encryption not Permitted .....	186
Poor Quality of a Released Document is not a Denial.....	186
Certain Third-Party Contracts Prohibited .....	187
Inadvertent Disclosure does not Waive Invocation of an Exemption at a Later Date .....	187
<b>Redaction of Records.....</b>	<b>188</b>
Redacting Exempted Material Authorized.....	188
Redaction is Permissible Even if the Record Becomes Devoid of Information .....	189
<b>Promises or Markings of Confidentiality .....</b>	<b>190</b>
A Promise to Avoid a FOIL Required Disclosure is not Binding .....	190
An Arbitrator Cannot Promise Confidentiality.....	190

<b>Fees for the Reproduction of Records.....</b>	<b>191</b>
Costs of Reproduction and Document Discovery Generally .....	191
Charging for Costs of Paper Reproduction Authorized.....	191
Actual Cost of Reproducing Records may be Allowed.....	191
Storage Device Costs may be Charged.....	192
Estimates must be Provided for “Actual Costs” .....	192
Charging for Time Searching is not Authorized.....	192
Charging for Redacting Records is not Permitted .....	193
Charging for Time Inspecting Records is not Authorized.....	193
Charges for Use of Outside Services Authorized .....	194
Electronic Retrieval and Compilation of Requested Information.....	194
Charging for Copying Electronically Stored Records .....	194
Creation of Records not Already in an Agency’s Possession is not Required .....	194
Copying Electronic Records is not Creating New Documents.....	195
Charging to Purchase New Software is Authorized .....	195
Charging for Updating Software to Reproduce a Record is not Authorized .....	196
Statutes Authorizing Other Fees Supersede FOIL.....	196
Local Laws may not Increase Fees .....	196
Waiving a Fee is not Required.....	196
Requiring Prepayment Prior to Production.....	196
Previously Produced Records .....	197
Subpoenas are not Required.....	197
Subscription Service for Minutes.....	197
<b>Denials of Requests .....</b>	<b>198</b>
Statement of Law .....	198
Statutorily Permitted Reasons for Denial – FOIL Exemptions .....	198
Compliance Difficulties are Impermissible Reasons for Denial.....	200
Denials must be in Writing.....	200
What Constitutes a Denial .....	200
Constructive Denials Constitute a Violation of FOIL .....	201
Blanket Redaction can Constitute a Denial of a Request .....	202

Requestor’s Motive is Irrelevant.....	202
Agency must Advise Requestor of Appeal Procedure.....	203
Refusing to Acknowledge the Mere Existence of Records may be Permissible .....	203
Previous Inadvertent Disclosure does not Waive Invocation of an Exemption.....	204
Creation of Records not Already in an Agency’s Possession is not Required .....	204
Electronic Retrieval and Compilation of Requested Information.....	205
Procuring New Software to Comply with Request is not Required .....	205
<b>“Overly Burdensome” Requests.....</b>	<b>207</b>
Burden upon the Agency is Generally not a Reason for Denial .....	207
Requests Requiring “Unreasonable Efforts” may be “Unduly Burdensome” .....	207
The Agency must Prove that the Request is “Unduly Burdensome”.....	208
Hiring an Outside Service is not Always Viable .....	208
Slow Computers are not an Excuse .....	209
Examples of Requests Deemed not to be Overly Burdensome .....	209
<b>The Appeals Process .....</b>	<b>210</b>
Statement of Law .....	210
<b>The Appeals Officer or Body .....</b>	<b>211</b>
Designation .....	211
Duties .....	211
<b>Appealing to the Agency.....</b>	<b>212</b>
Initiating an Administrative Appeal.....	212
Requestor’s Time to File Administrative Appeal .....	212
Agency’s Time to Respond to an Administrative Appeal .....	213
Proper Agency Appeals Body or Officer Must Render Final Disclosure Decisions .....	213
Agency must Advise Requestor of Proper Appeals Procedure .....	213
Reasons for Denial that are not Invoked During Appeal are Waived.....	214
Sample Appeal Form .....	215
<b>Exhausting Administrative Remedies.....</b>	<b>216</b>
Statement of Law .....	216
Failure to Respond to an Administrative Appeal Constitutes Denial and Exhaustion .....	216
Requestor not Required to Exhaust Administrative Remedies if doing so is Futile.....	216

Requestor not Required to Exhaust Administrative Remedies if Doing So Would Cause Irreparable Injury .....	217
Agency Must Advise Requestor of Proper Appeals Procedure .....	217
<b>Appealing to the Court .....</b>	<b>218</b>
Statement of Law .....	218
Administrative Remedies Must be Exhausted Prior to Court Intervention .....	218
Standing to Challenge Denials of Disclosure .....	218
Statute of Limitations.....	219
Time Runs Upon Notice of the Denial .....	219
Burden of Proof for Establishing that the Material is Protected.....	219
Judicial Review is Limited.....	220
The Agency’s Determination is not Binding on a Court .....	220
Court Review of Protected Material .....	220
In Camera Reviews can be Avoided by Agencies .....	221
Waiver of Arguments that Documents are Exempt .....	221
Courts may not Order Documents Released when an Exception Applies.....	222
Receiving Records During Appeal Deems Matter Moot.....	222
<b>FOIL Violations .....</b>	<b>223</b>
Courts may Award Fees.....	223
Willful Violations could be Criminal .....	223
No Violation When no Intent to Skirt the Law.....	223
42 U.S.C. § 1983 is not an Available Remedy Against a State Agency.....	223
<b>Attorneys’ Fees.....</b>	<b>224</b>
Statement of Law .....	224
Attorneys’ Fees for Failure to Timely Respond .....	224
Attorneys’ Fees for Improperly Withholding Records .....	224
Awarded Attorney and Litigation Fees must be Reasonable.....	225
Requestor must Substantially Prevail to Receive Attorneys’ Fees.....	225
Agency’s Reasonable Basis for Withholding Records may Preclude Award of Attorneys’ Fees .....	226
Attorney Serving as their Own Attorney may be Awarded Fees.....	228



<b>General Exceptions/Exemptions to Disclosure of Records .....</b>	<b>229</b>
List of Exception Categories.....	229
Burden of Proof.....	230
Release of Exempt Records to Another Agency.....	230
<b>Requesting Non-Disclosure Exceptions when Submitting Information to a State Agency</b>	<b>231</b>
Critical Infrastructure Information.....	231
Information Requested to be Excepted Remains Non-Disclosable Until Final Determination .....	231
State Agency Must Determine the Merits of the Request for the Exception.....	232
Information Remains Non-Disclosable for 15 Days After an Agency Determines that an Exception does not Apply.....	233
Appeals of Granted or Denied Non-Disclosure Exceptions .....	233
Article 78 Review is Available.....	233
<b>Records Except from Disclosure by Statute .....</b>	<b>235</b>
Exceptions Interpreted Narrowly .....	235
Exceptions Need not be Specifically Stated .....	235
Regulations are not State or Federal “Laws” .....	236
Administrative Codes are not State or Federal “Laws” .....	236
Executive Sessions of Public Agencies .....	237
Department of Motor Vehicle Records.....	237
Reports of Child Abuse are Confidential.....	237
Medical Records and Health Information.....	238
One’s Own Medical Records are not Exempt from Disclosure.....	240
Patient Medical Records .....	240
Patients in Health Care Facilities.....	240
State Employee’s Employment Information.....	240
Identities of Victims of Sexual Offenses .....	242
Criminal Proceedings in Favor of Accused .....	243
Jury Section Records.....	244
Workers’ Compensation Records Law § 110-A.....	244
Taxpayer Information .....	244

Items Exempt by Other Statutes .....	245
Statutes and Regulations which Require Disclosure .....	249
Statutes Determined not to Prohibit Disclosure.....	249
<b>Attorney-Client Privilege .....</b>	<b>252</b>
Statement of Law .....	252
The Client Owns the Privilege.....	253
Attorney Client Privilege can be Waived by Public Disclosure.....	253
State Agencies have Privilege with Attorney-General .....	253
Descriptions of Legal Services Provided are not Protected.....	253
Policies which Guide Legal Actions are not Exempt .....	254
<b>Social Security Numbers are Protected .....</b>	<b>255</b>
Definition .....	255
Restrictions on Release of Social Security Numbers.....	255
Release of Social Security Numbers Permitted .....	256
Laws which Govern Social Security Numbers .....	256
<b>Records Exempt Due to Impairment to Contracts .....</b>	<b>257</b>
Statement of Law .....	257
“Contract Awards” is not a Defined Phrase.....	257
The Primary Factor Involving Disclosure.....	257
Competition is a Critical Factor to the Exception.....	258
Expectations of Privacy are a Major Factor in the Evaluation .....	258
Bid Information is Likely Exempt from Disclosure .....	258
Bid Submissions, Prior to the Award, are Exempt from Disclosure .....	258
Property Appraisals for the Sale of Buildings are Exempt from Disclosure .....	259
Bids, Once Awarded, Must be Released.....	259
The Successful Bidder has no Right to Confidentiality.....	259
Public Information is not Confidential .....	259
Valuations of Items to be Sold are Exempt .....	259
Preliminary Negotiations are not Contract Awards .....	260
Once Award Recipients are Identified, the Exemption no Longer Applies .....	260
Records are not Exempt if Multiple Awards will be Made .....	260

Salary and Benefit Data is not Exempt.....	260
Cases Decided Prior to 2008 may no Longer be Valid.....	261
<b>Records Exempt Due to Impairment to Collective Bargaining Negotiations.....</b>	<b>262</b>
Statement of Law .....	262
Confidential Negotiations Before the Final Agreement can be Exempt from Disclosure.....	262
Collective Bargaining Studies are Exempt .....	263
Grievances and Decisions on Grievances will not Interfere.....	263
<b>Trade Secrets and Competitive Information are Exempt from Disclosure.....</b>	<b>264</b>
Statement of Law .....	264
Two Exemptions Exist in this Section with Different Requirements.....	264
What is a Trade Secret? .....	265
What is Competitive Information?.....	265
Information Derived from Confidential Information is Exempt.....	266
Competitive Information Requires Competitors.....	266
Factors to Determining Trade Secrets.....	267
Factors Weighing Against being a Trade Secret.....	267
Competitive Information should be Protected .....	268
Competitive Harm Depends on Value of Information to Competitors.....	268
Relative Cost to Acquire the Information is a Factor .....	269
The Volume of Information Released is a Factor.....	269
Information which is Widely Available is not Valuable .....	269
Information which was Expensive to Obtain Should be Exempt .....	269
Burden of Proof.....	270
Substantial Competitive Harm.....	270
A Public Agency may have Trade Secrets.....	270
Harm to a Public Agency is not the Concern.....	270
Substantial Benefits to Competitors are a Factor.....	271
Numerous Types of Records Could Cause Competitive Injury.....	271
Customer Names may be Protected from Disclosure .....	271
Information which would Deter Customer Use of Services .....	271
Information Gathered Throughout the Industry may Remove Protections .....	271

State Agency’s Duty to Create Regulations.....	272
Information Removing Bargaining Power in Contractual Negotiations is Protected.....	272
Customer Lists could be Trade Secrets.....	273
Requests for Non-Disclosure Exceptions may be Made.....	273
Agency Determination Granting or Denying a Request for a Non-Disclosure Exception may be Appealed .....	273
<b>Records Except for “Law Enforcement Purposes” .....</b>	<b>274</b>
Statement of Law .....	274
Limitations to Exception.....	274
“Law Enforcement” Purposes Applies to Some Civil Matters.....	275
Denying the Release of Records without Admitting the Records Exist .....	275
The Exception Outlasts the Conclusion of an Investigation.....	276
<b>Interference with Law Enforcement Investigations &amp; Judicial Proceedings.....</b>	<b>277</b>
Statement of the Law .....	277
Purpose of the Exception .....	277
Limitation of Exception .....	278
Two-Part Test is Used to Analyze Applicability .....	278
Step 1: “Law Enforcement” Applies to Criminal and Civil Matters .....	278
Some Audits are for Law Enforcement Purposes.....	279
Step 2: Will Disclosure Interfere with Enforcement or Proceedings?.....	279
Denials may be Generically Stated.....	279
Records in an Investigatory File are not Automatically Except .....	280
Possibility of Witness Tampering and Evading Detection Justifies Exception.....	280
The Exception is Inapplicable After the Matter is Concluded.....	280
Exception does not Apply to Unplanned Investigations in the Future .....	281
The Privacy Exception Remains Intact for “Cold Cases” .....	282
An Agency Need not Reveal if they are Investigating an Individual .....	282
Previously Releasing Records may Remove an Exception .....	282
Hearings are Judicial Proceedings .....	283
Salaries of Undercover Police Officers are Exempt .....	283
The Exception Outlasts the Conclusion of the Investigation.....	283

<b>Law Enforcement Purposes: Deprivation of a Fair Trial.....</b>	<b>284</b>
Statement of Law .....	284
The Exception Outlasts the Conclusion of the Investigation.....	284
<b>Law Enforcement Purposes: Confidential Sources and Information.....</b>	<b>285</b>
Statement of Law .....	285
The Purpose of this Exception .....	285
The Exception Only Applies Only Upon a Promise of Confidentiality .....	286
The Exception Outlasts the Conclusion of the Investigation.....	287
Confidential Sources and Confidential Information is Exempt.....	287
Non-Testifying Witnesses Information is Confidential.....	287
Criminal Procedure Law § 240.45 .....	287
Witnesses who Testify are not “Confidential”.....	288
Suspects in an Unfounded Investigation have a Privacy Interest .....	288
Laboratory Examinations are Exempt .....	288
List of Evidence is not Exempt.....	288
Records of a “Buy Operation” are Confidential .....	288
Information which will or will not Lead to Discovery of Witnesses.....	289
Complaints to the Internal Affairs Division are Privileged .....	289
Information need not be Held or Created by a Law Enforcement Agency .....	289
<b>Law Enforcement Purposes: Investigative Techniques.....</b>	<b>290</b>
Statement of Law .....	290
Foil’s Purpose is not to Impede Investigations .....	290
Nonroutine Criminal Investigative Techniques are Exempt.....	290
Routine Procedures and Techniques are not Exempt From Disclosure.....	291
Time Tested Techniques Could be Exempt .....	291
Specialized Police Policies, Training Materials and Procedures are Exempt.....	291
Techniques which Clarify the Law are not Except.....	291
Information about Specialized Police Vehicles may be Exempt .....	292
Extraordinary Investigative Techniques are Exempt.....	292
Surveillance Recordings may be Exempt, but not Always.....	292
Location of Automatic License Plate Readers not Exempt .....	293

Interference with Mobilization of Guard Units .....	293
Records Revealing Specialized Methods and Operations may be Exempt .....	294
Names of Persons on Counterterrorism and Surveillance Lists are Exempt .....	294
Employee Investigative Techniques are not Exempt.....	294
Techniques for Subduing Criminals and Prisoners may be Exempt.....	294
Identikit (Composite Drawing) Kits are Exempt From Disclosure .....	295
Investigative Methods.....	295
Routine Procedures for Using Surveillance Equipment are not Confidential .....	295
Internal Staff Investigation Procedures may be Exempt.....	296
Expense Reports of Undercover Officers and Investigations .....	296
Police Training Techniques, Including Canine Training, are Except.....	296
<b>Law Enforcement Purposes: Exception Due to Danger to Life or Safety .....</b>	<b>297</b>
Statement of Law .....	297
Burden of Proof: Life and Safety.....	297
Threat to a Witness' Safety is Legitimate Reason to Deny Records .....	297
Failure to Raise Defense does not Preclude Consideration by Court .....	297
Releasing Salaries of Police Officers Constitutes a Danger .....	298
Information about Specialized Police Vehicles may be Exempt .....	298
Confidential Sources are Exempt.....	298
Techniques for Subduing Criminals and Prisoners may be Exempt.....	299
Endangering Lives of Persons from Disclosure of their Names.....	299
Prison Cases are Plentiful .....	299
Information Available to the Public will not be Protected .....	301
Names of Witnesses who Never Testified are Exempt from Disclosure.....	301
The Disciplinary History of Police may be Withheld if it would Endanger Officers.....	301
Dd5s do not Receive a Blanket Exemption From Disclosure.....	302
Information About a Witness That Provided Exculpatory Testimony may be Disclosed.....	303
Police Officer Station Assignments and Precinct Rosters are Protected .....	303
Releasing Names of Gun Owners is a Threat to Life or Safety.....	303
Training and Mobilization Plans are Exempt .....	303
Home Addresses of Owners of Check-Cashing Businesses are Exempt.....	304

<b>The Inter/Intra-Agency Materials Exception.....</b>	<b>305</b>
Statement of Law .....	305
Purpose of the Exception .....	305
The General Rule of Disclosure.....	305
Confusion Caused by the “Double Negative” .....	306
Records with a Mix of Information can be Redacted But Disclosed.....	306
Materials Shared Between State and Federal Agencies.....	306
Communications Between Agencies and Consultants.....	307
Materials Shared Between a State Agency and a Contracted Agency or Consultant.....	308
The Relationship of the Agencies is Critical to Evaluate .....	309
<b>Statistical or Factual Tabulations or Data must be Released.....</b>	<b>310</b>
Statement of Law .....	310
Definitions.....	310
The General Rule of Disclosure.....	310
Factual Tabulations, Statistical and Backup Data, Must be Released .....	311
Examples of Statistics that Must be Disclosed .....	311
Ratings are not Statistics.....	312
<b>Instructions to Staff must be Released.....</b>	<b>313</b>
Statement of Law .....	313
What are “Instructions”.....	313
Purchase Orders Constitute “Instructions to Staff” .....	313
Training Materials may Constitute “Instructions to Staff” .....	313
Contingent Instructions are not Instructions .....	313
Sample Language is not Instructional Language .....	313
Matters Affecting Public Health Affect the Public.....	314
Instructions From Public Safety.....	314
Manuals Describing Investigative Techniques .....	314
Policies which Guide Legal Actions are not Exempt .....	315
<b>Final Agency Determinations must be Released.....</b>	<b>316</b>
Statement of Law .....	316
Documents Used to Arrive at a Final Decision are Public Records .....	316

Limitations to the Exception.....	316
Pre-Decisional Materials Need not be Released.....	316
Rationale Underlying Hiring Need not be Disclosed .....	317
Legal Opinions are Exempt From Disclosure.....	318
Pre-Decisional Material vs. Post-Decisional Material.....	318
Pre-Decisional “Fluid” Advice is not Disclosable.....	318
Hearing Officer Disciplinary Decisions and Recommendations .....	319
Non-Binding Hearing Officer Recommendations .....	320
Hearing Officer Recommendations which are Binding or Adopted.....	320
Deliberative Material is Exempt .....	321
Exchanges of Ideas are Exempt .....	321
Intra-Agency, Pre-Decisional Materials are Exempt.....	321
Factual Observations and Data are not Exempt From Disclosure .....	321
Drafts are Exempt From Disclosure .....	322
Other Examples of Final Agency Decisions which are not Exempt.....	322
Examples of Records which are Exempt From Disclosure .....	322
<b>External Audits must be Released.....</b>	<b>324</b>
Statement of Law .....	324
<b>Examination Questions and Answers are Exempt.....</b>	<b>325</b>
Statement of Law .....	325
Examples of Proper Responses.....	325
The Agency Determines when an Examination is “Finally Administered” .....	325
Grading Criteria are not Examination Questions.....	326
<b>Exceptions Due to Security Concerns .....</b>	<b>327</b>
Statement of Law .....	327
Burden of Proof.....	327
Software as a Record .....	327
Information which Could Lead to Cyber Attacks is Exempt.....	328
Examples of Exempt Materials.....	329
<b>Exception for Certain Photographs and Images.....</b>	<b>330</b>
Statement of Law .....	330



Photographs are “Records” .....	330
Photographs Under Vehicle & Traffic Law .....	330
Cameras Detecting Violation of Red Light Laws.....	330
Cameras Detecting Posted Maximum Speed Limits in a School Speed Zone .....	331
Cameras Detecting Compliance with Posted Maximum Speed Limits in a Highway Construction or Maintenance Work Area Located on a Controlled-Access Highway .....	331
Cameras Detecting Failure of Operator to Stop for a School Bus Displaying a Red Visual Signal and Stop-Arm.....	332
Weigh in Motion Demonstration Program on Interstate Route 278 in Kings County.....	332
Cameras Detecting Failure of Operator to Comply with Bus Lane Restrictions.....	332
Toll Collection Systems.....	332
<b>Unwarranted Invasions of Personal Privacy .....</b>	<b>333</b>
Statement of Law .....	333
What Constitutes an Unwarranted Invasion of Personal Privacy .....	333
Committee may Promulgate Rules .....	334
Statutorily Listed Categories Constituting Unwarranted Invasions.....	334
Examples of Unwarranted Invasions .....	335
Examples that are not Unwarranted Invasions.....	336
<b>Redaction/Deletion of Personal Details in Records.....</b>	<b>338</b>
Statement of Law .....	338
Committee may Promulgate Rules on Deleting Personal Details .....	338
What can be Deleted/Redacted .....	338
Names and Home Addresses may be Deleted as “Identifying Details” .....	339
When Redaction of Identifying Details is Appropriate .....	340
When Redaction is Inappropriate.....	341
<b>Statutory Categories of Unwarranted Invasions .....</b>	<b>343</b>
<b>Medical History Exemption .....</b>	<b>344</b>
Statement of Law .....	344
What is a Medical History .....	344
Records Recognized to Contain Medical Histories .....	344
Records Recognized to not Contain Medical Histories .....	345

<b>Employment History Exemption .....</b>	<b>346</b>
Records Recognized to not Contain Employment Histories.....	346
Personal References of Applicants for Employment Exempt.....	347
<b>Credit History Exemption .....</b>	<b>348</b>
Statement of Law .....	348
<b>Medical and Personal Records at Medical Facilities .....</b>	<b>349</b>
Statement of Law .....	349
<b>Solicitation and Fundraising Purposes of Requests.....</b>	<b>350</b>
Statement of Law .....	350
Silence for the Reason for the Request may Result in Denial .....	350
Even Partial Information Used for Fundraising is a Reason for Denial .....	350
Redacting Names and Addresses Usually Removes This Exception .....	350
Releasing Information Leading to Discovery of Names and Addresses .....	351
Solicitation for New Members Constitutes Fundraising.....	351
Solicitation of Accident Victims is Prohibited .....	351
Use of Names for a Civil Suit is not Prohibited.....	351
An Individual’s Consent to Use Information is not a Consent to Use Information for Fundraising .....	352
An Individual’s Consent to Use Information for Promotional Purposes may Permit Public Disclosure of Some Identifying Information .....	352
<b>Disclosure Resulting in Economic or Personal Hardship .....</b>	<b>353</b>
Statement of Law .....	353
Agency’s Burden .....	353
When the Exemption is Properly Invoked.....	353
When the Exemption is not Properly Invoked.....	353
<b>Personal Information Reported in Confidence to an Agency and not Relevant to the Ordinary Work of the Agency .....</b>	<b>356</b>
Statement of Law .....	356
Meaning of Personal Nature .....	356
Personal Nature vs. Professional Nature.....	357
<b>Information Relevant to the Ordinary Work of an Agency .....</b>	<b>358</b>
Statement of Law .....	358

Examples of Information Relevant to Agency Work .....	358
Examples of Information Irrelevant to Agency Work .....	359
<b>Information of a Personal Nature Included in Workers' Compensation Records.....</b>	<b>360</b>
Statement of Law .....	360
Meaning of "Personal Nature" .....	360
Personal Nature vs. Professional Nature.....	361
Redaction Permissible.....	361
Limited Exception to Disclosure of Workers' Compensation Records.....	361
<b>Disclosure of a Taxpayer's Electronic Contact Information .....</b>	<b>363</b>
Statement of Law .....	363
Real Property Tax Law § 104.....	363
<b>Disclosure of Arrest/Booking Photographs .....</b>	<b>364</b>
Statement of Law .....	364
Exemption Applies Only to Photographs .....	364
State Law Precludes Disclosure in Some Cases .....	364
Constitutional Considerations Preclude Disclosure in Some Cases .....	365
Names of Youth Held in Custody may be Exempt.....	365
<b>Public Employees Enjoy Less Privacy Protections .....</b>	<b>366</b>
Statement of Law .....	366
Volunteers may be Considered Public Employees for FOIL Purposes .....	367
Examples of Public Employee Records which were Ordered to be Released.....	367
<b>Additional Personal Privacy Considerations.....</b>	<b>369</b>
Unlisted Telephone Numbers are Exempt From Disclosure .....	369
Criminal Surveillance may be Exempt From Disclosure .....	369
Publicly Available Information is not Entitled to Privacy.....	369
Names and Addresses of 9/11 Families are Exempt.....	369
Speculation That Identity can be Discovered is not Sufficient Reason to Withhold Records..	370
Inmates/Detainees Enjoy Less Privacy Protections.....	370
Records which, If Released, would not Constitute an Invasion of Privacy .....	370
Criminal History Reports of Jurors, Witnesses and Victims .....	371
"Judgments" are not Protected.....	371

Names of those with Pistol Permits .....	372
Documents which are Protected by Privacy Rights.....	372
<b>Balancing Test is Required when no Exemption Applies.....</b>	<b>373</b>
Statement of Law .....	373
Burden of Proving.....	374
The Requestor’s Interests must Promote the Interests of FOIL.....	374
Information about Private Individuals who do not Serve the Public is Less Likely to be Disclosed .....	376
Waivers by the Subjects of the Request may Remove Privacy Concerns .....	376
Surviving Family Members have a Privacy Interest.....	377
Names of those Acquitted in Criminal Proceedings may be Exempt.....	377
<b>Law Enforcement and Firefighter Disciplinary Records.....</b>	<b>378</b>
Statement of Law .....	378
Barriers to Law Enforcement Personnel Records Removed.....	378
Volunteer Firefighters may be Subject to the New Law.....	379
Law Enforcement Disciplinary Records are not Exempt .....	379
Redaction of Certain Information Required and Permitted .....	382
Records Created After 2020 are not Exempt From Disclosure .....	383
Categorical Exemptions no Longer Exist .....	384
The New Standard of Review: is a Release of the Disciplinary Record an Invasion of Privacy? .....	384
Redacting Identifying Details Avoids the Invasion of Privacy .....	385
Open and Unsubstantiated Claims Must be Released, Subject to Redaction .....	386
Records Concerning Open Complaints against Police Officers .....	387
Records Concerning Unsubstantiated Complaints against Police Officers .....	387
Requesting Ones Own Employment Records.....	388
Collective Bargaining Agreements Cannot Promise Confidentiality .....	388
The Taylor Law does not Protect Disclosure of Records .....	388
Substantiated and Unsubstantiated Claims Must be Released.....	388
Unfounded Disciplinary Records are not Available Under Discovery Statutes.....	389
Unusual Incident Reports, Use of Force Reports, Inmate Misbehavior Reports are not Personnel Records .....	389

Records Prior to 2020 are Likely Exempt From Disclosure.....	389
The Law Prior to 2020 on Disclosure of Records.....	391
Prior Exceptions to Confidentiality .....	391
Disciplinary Determinations were Exempt “Personnel Records” .....	392
The Exception was not Limited to Litigation .....	392
Civilian Complaints were Exempt From Disclosure .....	392
Post-Resignation Investigations were not Protected.....	394
<b>Judiciary and Court Proceedings .....</b>	<b>395</b>
Court Proceedings are not Subject to FOIL.....	395
Office of Court Administration is Subject to FOIL .....	395
Grand Jury Proceedings are Exempt.....	395
District Attorney’s “Action Sheets” are Exempt .....	396
Position Statements are Exempt.....	397
Names and Personal Information of Witnesses are Confidential .....	397
Names and Statements of Non-Testifying Witnesses are Confidential .....	397
Cooperation Agreements of Eye-Witnesses are not Discoverable .....	398
Witness Information is Public After Testimony is Given.....	398
<b>The Public Interest Privilege.....</b>	<b>399</b>
Witness Statements made to Prosecutors.....	400
Overcoming the Privilege .....	400
Perjury may Justify Disclosure .....	401
<b>Access to State Legislative Records.....</b>	<b>402</b>
Foil does not Apply to the State Legislature.....	402
Regulations are Required.....	402
<b>Records Management Programs .....</b>	<b>404</b>
Statutory Requirements.....	404
What is a Record? .....	405
Steps to Creating a Records Management Program .....	405
Appoint a Records Management Officer .....	406
Legal Mandates for the Records Retention Officer .....	406
Where to Start: Inventory Your Records .....	407

Appraise the Records .....	407
Active and Inactive Records .....	408
Create a Records Management Plan .....	408
Destruction of Records .....	409
Copying the Record is Permitted .....	409
Electronic Records .....	409
Attributes of a Successful Records Management Program.....	410
Creating Only Required Records .....	410
Retaining Only the Required Records .....	410
Proper Storage Procedures.....	411
Access to Records.....	412
Locating Records .....	412
Use of Technology .....	413
Benefit to the Public.....	413
Updating and Monitoring of the Records Management Program.....	413
Sample Records Management Program.....	414
Records Management Program Forms.....	423

**TABLE OF CONTENTS FOR THE  
“PERSONAL PRIVACY PROTECTION LAW”**

<b>The Personal Privacy Protection Law</b> .....	427
Purpose of the Personal Privacy Protection Law .....	428
Agencies Covered by these Laws: State Agencies .....	429
Entities Exempt from the Personal Privacy Law .....	430
Data Subjects .....	430
Miscellaneous Definitions .....	430
What is a Record.....	430
“Records” are Limited to those in Indexed Computer Databases.....	431
A Public Safety Agency’s Records are not Included .....	432
The Purpose of The Law is to Restrict Access, Not Grant Access .....	432
Duty to Protect the “System Of Records” .....	433
Obligations of Covered Entities.....	433
Collection of Personal Information.....	434
Duty to Grant Access to Records to Data Subjects.....	434
Other Laws Governing Record Maintenance .....	435
Duty to Correct Records or Personal Information .....	435
Waivers of Confidentiality are Prohibited .....	437
Exemptions from Disclosure.....	437
Limited Ability to Withhold Sources of Information.....	438
Notifications Required .....	438
Prohibition on Destruction.....	439
Disclosure Authorized in Certain Instances.....	439
Disclosures which are not Required .....	442
Contracts for Collection of Information .....	442
Duty to Create Written Policies .....	442
Miscellaneous Duties .....	442
Rules Required to be Implemented.....	443

Duties for Certain Disclosures .....	444
Notifications to Committee On Open Government .....	445
Privacy Impact Statements.....	446
Civil Remedies for Violations.....	447
No Private Right of Action Exists to Sue the State.....	447
Agency Reports Required.....	447
Records Transferred to the State Archives.....	448